

COMMISSION ON APPELLATE COURT APPOINTMENTS

MINUTES

October 9, 2020

PRESENT: Chief Justice Robert Brutinel, Chair; Ammon Barker; Laura Ciscomani; Buchanan Davis; William Gresser; Tracy Munsil; Gerald Nabours; Jonathan Paton; Daniel Seiden; Kevin Taylor; Kathryn Townsend; Tina Vannucci; Linley Wilson and James Zieler

REMOTELY: Jaime Chamberlain

ABSENT: Larry Suciu

Chief Justice Brutinel called the meeting to order at 8:02 a.m. to interview democratic and republican candidates for nomination to the Arizona Independent Redistricting Commission. He announced that Jaime Chamberlain would join the meeting via Zoom and Larry Suciu would not be present.

A motion to go into executive session for the purpose of discussing interview questions was made at 8:04 a.m. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

The Commission returned to public session at 8:28 a.m.

Interviews of Democratic Candidates

From 8:29 a.m. to 8:53 a.m., the Commission interviewed Grant Freeland, Susan Freeman and Donald Evans.

Kathryn Townsend moved to modify the third question for the candidates. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

It was noted that the question change would not be held against the first three candidates.

From 8:56 a.m. to 9:55 a.m., the Commission interviewed Art Hinshaw, Grant Buma, Ernest Calderon, Mark Murphy, and Elizabeth Bernstein.

Break from 9:55 a.m. to 10:05 a.m.

From 10:07 a.m. to 10:29 a.m. the Commission interviewed Teresa Wyatt and Rodolfo Espino. Ms. Wyatt was interviewed out of order due to technical difficulties.

A motion to go into executive session for part of Rodolfo Espino's interview was made at 10:24 a.m. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

The Commission returned to public session at 10:29 a.m.

From 10:30 a.m. to 11:41 a.m. the Commission interviewed Martha Durkin, Robert Kovitz, Derrick Watchman, James Robbins, Maxine White, Bryan Cooperrider, Shereen Lerner, Dale Keyes and Sheila Harris.

Break from 11:41 a.m. to 11:47 a.m.

Discussion of Democratic Applicants and Interviews

Chief Justice Brutinel opened the floor for discussion. He suggested a straw poll by reading the names alphabetically then the Commission could decide who to add to a tentative list.

The Commission discussed the democratic applicants' qualifications and the interviews.

A straw vote was conducted to focus discussion and determine whether any strong consensus existed on the potential nomination list. The results of the straw poll were:

Elizabeth Bernstein – 3	S. Arthur Hinshaw – 6
Grant Buma – 6	Dale Keyes – 0
Ernest Calderon – 14	Robert Kovitz – 12
Bryan Cooperrider – 14	Shereen Lerner – 8
Martha Durkin – 3	Mark Murphy – 3
Rodolfo Espino – 0	James Robbins, Jr. – 11
Donald Evans – 12	Derrick Watchman – 14
Grant Freeland – 5	Maxine White – 12
Susan Freeman – 1	Teresa Wyatt – 9
Sheila Harris – 6	

The Commission discussed the results of the straw vote.

Chief Justice Brutinel suggested a revote on the three candidates who tied with 6 votes each as the Commission had done the previous day.

Chief Justice Brutinel called for a second straw vote on Grant Buma, Sheila Harris and Arthur Hinshaw. The result of the second vote were:

Grant Buma – 8
Sheila Harris – 1
Arthur Hinshaw - 5

Selection of Democratic Nominees

Gerry Nabours moved to finalize the list of democratic candidates which included **Grant Buma, Ernest Calderon, Bryan Cooperrider, Donald Evans, Robert Kovitz, Shereen Lerner, James Robbins, Derrick Watchman, Maxine White and Teresa Wyatt**. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 14-0-1 with Chief Justice Brutinel abstaining.

The Commission recessed for lunch from 12:13 p.m. to 1:10 p.m.

Interviews of Republican Candidates

Chief Justice Brutinel noted for the record that Douglas York would be interviewed later than his scheduled interview.

From 1:13 p.m. to 2:09 p.m. the Commission interviewed Kevin Kopp, Margaret Bevan, Paul Djurisc, Jonathan Allred, Brandi Oveson, Lisa Davis and Walter Schoch.

It was noted that David Lane did not appear for his scheduled interview.

Break from 2:09 p.m. to 2:33 p.m.

From 2:33 p.m. to 2:44 p.m. the Commission interviewed Douglas York and William Turner.

The Commission was ahead of schedule and took a break from 2:45 p.m. to 2:59 p.m.

From 2:59 p.m. to 4:08 p.m. the Commission interviewed Michael Striplin, Trevor Abarzua, Megan Gould Maestas, David Mehl, Edwin Winkler, Grant Smith, Donald Wilson and Brian Hatheway.

Break from 4:08 p.m. to 4:20 p.m.

Discussion of Republican Applicants and Interviews

Chief Justice Brutinel opened the floor for discussion. He suggested a straw poll by reading the names alphabetically then the Commission could decide who to add to a tentative list.

The Commission discussed the republican applicants' qualifications and the interviews.

A straw vote was conducted to focus discussion and determine whether any strong consensus existed on the potential nomination list. The results of the straw poll were:

Trevor Abarzua – 2
Jonathan Allred – 11
Margaret Bevan – 6
Scott Crouch – 12
Lisa Davis – 8
Paul Djurismic – 7
Megan Gould Maestas – 1
Brian Hatheway – 1
Kevin Kopp – 13
David Lane – 0

David Mehl – 13
Brandi Oveson – 13
Walter Schoch – 12
Grant Smith – 0
Michael Striplin – 10
William Turner – 5
Donald Wilson – 6
Edwin Winkler – 4
Douglas York – 9

The Commission discussed the results of the straw vote.

Selection of Republican Nominees

Buchanan Davis moved to finalize the list of republican candidates that received 7 or more votes and included **Jonathan Allred, Scott Crouch, Lisa Davis, Paul Djurismic, Kevin Kopp, David Mehl, Brandi Oveson, Walter Schoch, Michael Striplin** and **Douglas York**. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 12-2-1 with Chief Justice Brutinel abstaining.

Linley Wilson made a motion to go into executive session at 4:47 p.m. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

The Commission returned to public session at 4:55 p.m.

Chief Justice Brutinel thanked the Commission for all their work.

Jonathan Paton moved to adjourn the meeting at 4:56 p.m. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Respectfully submitted,

Gerald Nabours
Commission Secretary